

The Flute Becomes a Gun: A Flautist's Perspectives on Aryan Kaganof's Film *Night is Coming: A Threnody for the Victims of Marikana*

Marietjie Pauw
Stellenbosch University

The new psychological automaton that Deleuze distinguishes in the time-image also corresponds to the schizo: characters that are no longer driven by psychologically motivated motor action, but are defined in relation to the affects they can trigger.

Patricia Pisters (2008, 112)

[The film] is an elegy for those who must survive Marikana as event.
Aidan Erasmus (2015)¹

ABSTRACT

In Aryan Kaganof's film *Night is Coming: A Threnody for the Victims of Marikana* (2014), the filmmaker registers a critical perspective on an inter-disciplinary conference that attempted to hear landscape 'critically' without hearing the event of Marikana as a grotesque blight on the South African landscape. During the same conference the author played a flute solo by Stanley Glasser to sound aspects of the local South African landscape. In Kaganof's film the image of the flute is merged into the image of a gun by rapid edits alternating between footage of the concert and of the massacre. In so doing, the flute becomes the gun and the flautist becomes the gunner. In this article I explore the potential residue deposited by this film on my flute concert practice. I rely on analyses by Aidan Erasmus, Heidi Grunebaum, Gilles Deleuze and Patricia Pisters in particular. I then draw on aspects of contemporary curatorial practice to argue that this film subversively reinforces an acknowledgement of the power of curatorial intervention with respect to classical performance sites of the flute. Hereby, the Glasser solo potentially transforms from 'aesthetic product' into 'artistic argument' (Borgdorff 2012).

Depiction of a Filmmaker's Intervention

Partly due to my scholarly interest in landscape as topic for music concerts I served on a committee that helped administrate the 'Hearing Landscape Critically' conference that took place in Stellenbosch in 2013. This conference was the second in a series of three inter-disciplinary conferences that investigated music and landscape as topics.²

The administrative committee for the 2013 conference attempted to contextualise the notion of landscape by noting that land is also shaped by layers of inscribed harm – like poverty and contested land ownership – and constituted by mud, excrement and waste. For this reason, the committee arranged a walk on the local rubbish dump, screened potentially provocative films, and commissioned several creative outputs, one of which incorporated film media. For the latter we extended an unscripted commission to the filmmaker Aryan Kaganof to attend the conference and then to produce a series of short films in response. Kaganof produced a long film of 73 minutes titled *Night is Coming: A Threnody for the Victims of Marikana*. He also produced an editor's cut of 27 minutes in length (from the longer version) under the title of *Threnody for the Victims of Marikana*.³

The film takes the violence of the Marikana 'ritual murders' (as Kaganof calls them), together with 'blindness' and 'omission' as topics. The filmmaker critically addresses the conference, academe and musicology in particular for having omitted mention of the Marikana massacre, an event that the film calls a 'blight' on the recent South African landscape. The film critiques and laments this omission as an ideological distortion; a form of blindness.

As part of the 2013 conference programme I, with fellow musicians, presented a flute and chamber music concert titled *Water, Stray Cattle, and the Urban: Dwelling in South African Landscapes*.⁴ We played compositions by Fiona Tozer, Stanley Glasser, Bongani Ndodana-Breen and Hans Huyssen, each of which highlighted various aspects of the tensions of landscape. *Jabula* (meaning happy), a solo flute composition by Stanley Glasser, and a video recording of my rendition of this composition, became central to the filmmaker's argument. This composition and its filmed portrayal are also relevant to the discussion here.

In prior e-mail correspondence with the filmmaker in August 2013, our discussion turned to his preference for the solo flute music of Giacinto Scelsi, for example a composition titled *Pwyll* (1954). I mentioned my training in international styles of flute playing, but with significant focus on the French flute school and its tone. I further observed that my flute tone required re-contextualising and re-sounding for playing some of the existing local repertoire. I noted to Kaganof that I was looking for and finding a different grain to my flautistic voice in order to sound local music and local tensions.

Little did I know that the filmmaker would re-contextualise my flute's 'grain' by overdubbing a cello accompaniment by Frances-Marie Uitti and percussion by Niklas Zimmer onto my solo flute playing and, more radically, by transforming the flute from an aesthetic implement into an instrument of violence. In the film, by means of a series of visual repeat edits, the flute is manoeuvred into the position and pulsating action of a gun. Visual flashes as well as percussive sound effects contribute to this image, rendered in conjunction with media footage of the Marikana massacre. The bodies of the flautist and a police gunner merge: the flute, held sideways and filmed from the left only, is manipulated into the arms and position of the police gunner. My arm is his arm, my body is his body. While the flautist plays Glasser's composition in the safe landscape of a concert hall, in this film she simultaneously becomes the gunner at Wonderkop outside Rustenburg, where dust and death are seen and heard. The applause of the audience at the end of the performance of *Jabula* is the repeat action hail of bullets from gunfire.

In contrast to the flute's apparently pastoral connotations (Monelle 2006, 207-208; 265-266; 271), compositions for the flute that portray gun violence do exist: *rapid fire* for solo flute by Jennifer Higdon mourns inner-city death and violence as the flute sounds the gun, while Jimi Hendrix's *Machine Gun*, as performed by bass flautist Robert Dick, imitates the sound of the gun (see discography for details). Both of these compositions achieve distance between message and musical instrument, so that the flute, flautist and audience are encouraged to reflect critically on violence. In these examples wastage of human life is lamented. In Kaganof's film, however, distance collapses: the flute *becomes*

the gun; the flautist *becomes* the gunner. Flute and flautist become violence incarnate.

The Image of the Gunner-Flautist, and I

Heidi Grunebaum (2015) observes that '[t]here are no ready-made moral positions or political narratives that art can provide about the [Marikana] massacre that are beyond complicity'. Furthermore, Aidan Erasmus (2015) notes that the film's percussive effects together with the visual flashes resonate with South African reality. He states that 'the percussive reality of South Africa becomes deafening. Percussive, in the way in which the sound of hi-hats coincides with the flashing of images during Marietjie Pauw's performance, but also in the sense in which [one] might imagine beating and the beat as much more than just musical, but at once sociological and psychoanalytic'.

Kaganof's depiction of my flute playing as centrally involved in the ritual murder of Marikana, coupled with comments such as these, compel me to reflect on my role as South African flautist, and my symbolic complicity in the systemic violence of which Marikana – from Kaganof's perspective – is its apocalyptic apotheosis. The prospect of complicity both abhors and enchants. Abhors, for I am a pacifist; enchants, for the classical flute symbolically becomes an unexpected instrument of power. If I am symbolically complicit and becoming violence incarnate, I am somehow implicated in murder. At least, this is what the film seems to argue. Through the analogy between flute and gun, the film sets out to deliver critical commentary on the selected repertoire and on the concert setting in which it is played, using unaware actors at hand to do so. The fact that I was unaware of how the video footage of my flute playing would be incorporated into *Night is Coming* provides little consolation here, given the film's extended thematisation of blindness and omission. The cold aloofness, machinistic madness and sheer violence exuded by the image of the gunner-flautist prompt further observations, for, as Patricia Pisters (2009) notes: 'even if everybody knows that an image is staged, it has an effect: it penetrates our mind and puts itself somewhere in the flux of images.'

In the scene in question, the flautist is depicted in black and white, playing Western art music in a rigid concert setting. Helgé Janssen (2014) describes the scene as 'a stark monochrome flute performance by soloist Marietjie Pauw'. The black and white edit of the flautist and the audience strikes me as ominous, with the audience seated in a semi-dark concert hall, mute, applauding with gunfire. Does the filmmaker use monochrome aesthetics to indicate, perhaps, that he is 'framing' me, 'framing' the audience? ('Using' me, as one concerned flute colleague earnestly pointed out.) Does the monochrome edit highlight differences in skin tone and privilege? Does the filmmaker's 'use' of the white player and mostly-white audience, together with a portrayal of relentless and unstoppable playing, underscore easy polarities induced on society by racial South African histories and the colonial heritage of Western art music? Perhaps, yes. On the one hand these polarities are drawn on too easily and yet, on the other, these are also strategies that align with the filmmaker's critique of, for example, omission.

In terms of the above explication, the film overexposes my whiteness. This white musical skin 'barricades' and excludes, acting as 'wall', 'frontier' and 'border land' as Lindsay Bremner notes in her essay 'Border/Skin' (Bremner 2008, 167; 171). Bremner translates the 'bio-politics' of skin to architectural apartheid (2008, 167). In a similar way *Night is Coming* translates the bio-politics of skin into musical apartheid. I am therefore cast as representative of power and privilege in the film, but remain so – in real life – by the colour of my skin. Equally so, the music I play (originally transported to this continent also as a tool in the colonial 'civilising mission') is uncomfortably symbolic of power and privilege. These symbols sit uneasily amidst current critical discourses of decoloniality.

I am reminded that the repertoire and concert conventions of Western art music are ritualised and embedded in a Western-aligned way of *doing*. Decoloniality, as theorised by scholars Walter Mignolo, Rolando Vázquez and others, reminds us that the Western way of engaging with knowledge production, as well as the hegemonic dissemination of knowledge to subaltern people, has occurred through forms of domination whereby Western knowledge believed itself to foster the betterment and upliftment of non-Western knowledge systems (Mignolo 2012). By

contrast, in the theoretical and practical interventions of decolonial aestheSis (with the rebellious capitalised S in place), the subaltern's revolt works towards pluriversality, also in music and arts (Mignolo and Vázquez 2013). Walter Mignolo, for example, advocates the 'decolonising' of Occidental aesthetics to liberate decolonial aestheSis (Mignolo 2012, xvii).

Amidst local interpretations of decoloniality the questions then surface of *how, and in what ways* do I continue to play the classical flute, to play the repertoire of the classical flute, and to participate in conventional Western concert practice? Am I able to find ways, as a classical musician, to be part of subaltern revolt and intervention?

Analyses of Strategies in the Film

I turn next to an analysis of compositional and cinematographic strategies in the film in an attempt to merge my reflections on the image of the gunner-flautist with theoretical suggestions. I describe eight such strategies, some of which align with notions from schizoanalysis. I include observations by Patricia Pisters (2008), since her pervasive presence on Kaganof's blog suggests that she plays an influential role in his filmmaking.⁵ I also include observations by Helen Darby (2013) on cinema in general, and by Heidi Grunebaum (2015) and Aidan Erasmus (2015), both of whom comment on the shorter Kaganof film. I include Stephanus Muller's (2013) notion of 'excess' and furthermore refer to Veit Erlmann's suggestion of 'anthropological listening' (2010) in order to incorporate his notion of sound that stops time. The Deleuzian notions of schizophrenia, and *time-image* screen shots in cinema (also explored by Donato Totaro), I then find, contribute to making sense of the image of the gunner-flautist.

One of the filmmaker's strategies in *Night is Coming*, is to dismember body parts from bodies, and the flautist is not spared. Although the flautist is not reduced to her shoes, or to her cuffs, or to unseeing eyes (in the way that other actors in the film are portrayed), her flute is extracted and redeposited as a gun. Deleuzian analysis calls such dismemberment 'body without organs', or BwO (Pisters 2008, 105). BwO refers to abnormal connections made by the brain and an increasing impairment of the senso-motoric, of emotion and of cognition to the point of death. As

Patricia Pisters notes, when there is 'no mouth, no tongue and no teeth, suicide occurs' (Pisters 2008, 105).

Such dismemberment is suggested by Grunebaum (2015) to be an act of decomposition. She contrasts the terms 'composition' and 'decomposition' on the terrain of classical music when she notes that Kaganof critiques "'composition" by incorporating decomposition to show that complicity is effected' (Grunebaum 2015). In the resulting stasis, death occurs.

Another strategy of the filmmaker is the use of the close-up which, in cinema, 'takes the face apart' from the body, as Darby argues in her analytic of 'place, space and face' informed by Deleuzian schizoanalysis (Darby 2013, 295). With the close-up, Darby suggests, faciality implies delirium loosened from identity. The close-up of a human face dismantles 'ingrained assumptions' and produces 'new traversals of the social field' (295). She notes that the close-up of the dismembered face deems subjectivity to be 'non-human, imperceptible and faceless' (Darby 2013, 296). Throughout Kaganof's film the close-ups, some of which are unnervingly tilted, overthrow accepted notions of portraying emotion or compassion, and instead show faces that play doggedly, conduct music persistently, and deliver speeches unremittingly.

Grunebaum (2015) points to another strategy when she observes that the camera direction and subsequent point of view are aligned with those that shoot and kill at the massacre (this includes the flautist). She suggests that a 'state-aligned perspective' is hereby created in the film. Erasmus (2015) elaborates this notion by stating that '[t]he police state is made loud and clear in the articulation of the dirge, of the lament that finds itself in conversation with what may seem like arbitrary noise'.⁶

However, the more disturbing point of view in this film engages with the complicity of all viewers of the film. Grunebaum (2015) asks whether we as viewers become complicit in the act of killing through the mere act of 'looking at the footage ... [through] watching it again and again'. She argues that this aspect is reinforced as there is 'no egalitarian point of view, no sharing or shared perspective with the dead'.

The filmmaker also uses techniques that have been described as 'spectres of excess' by Stephanus Muller (2013). In this film excess

occurs in the repetition of scenes, phrases and noises, so that initial shock is blunted through a repetition that at some point reverses the psychological process and starts to drive a heightened tension. Muller notes that 'excess, debauchery and nihilism', together with transgression, mark the films of Kaganof.

The filmmaker uses sound to 'stop' us; to make us think, and to conflate the real with the unreal. Erlmann (2010, 339) notes that '[t]he ultimate lesson of [an] anthropology of listening is perhaps the idea that it is in the plenitude of presence, in a realm beyond the threshold of sensory immediacy, but also well below the arrogance of reason, that musical situations put a stop to time'. Aryan Kaganof's film mediates juxtaposing sounds that do not in reality belong together (solo flute music, added accompaniment, gun fire, voices shouting, etc.,) by projecting them onto a landscape in order to 'stop time'. The film and its layered sounds require viewers to interact with and reflect on police-guns, flute-guns, the filmed audience and the film audience, whether real or unreal. In this landscape, when sound puts a stop to time, we are faced with a reality too unbearable to deal with. In Kaganof's film a disorientation of sounds combined with unreal images brings this point home in a process similar to Gilles Deleuze's analysis of the cinematic 'time-image'.

An analysis by Pisters suggests that disorientation and wildness are characteristics of schizophrenia, and that the Deleuzian time-image portrays this madness. Donato Totaro (1999) suggests that the Deleuzian time-image (in contrast to the motion image) fuses 'pastness' and 'presentness' in a single shot.⁷ Pastness is subjective, virtual and based on recollection, whereas presentness is objective, actual and based on what is perceived. The time-image merges both of these, and 'lives at the limit of an indiscernible actual and virtual image' (Totaro 1999, 1).

In her analysis of the time-image Pisters (2008, 103) notes that it equates with distortion and delirium, characteristics that are also found in clinical schizophrenia as brain disease. For Pisters (2008, 112) the time-image operates as 'indiscernibility' and 'undecidability' so that clear categories are erased between dreamworld and actuality, between experiences of past and present, and between truth and fiction. In the process 'reality is endowed with the virtual' (Pisters 2008, 112). This 'reality

of illusion' is, for her, a reality nonetheless, for 'even if it is not actual, it is very real' (2008, 112-113).

The delirium that is portrayed in the cinematography of the schizophrenic can act as a 'barricade' to atrocity. Pisters suggests that when cinema of this kind makes 'wild' connections, our brains equally make 'false' connections and disconnections out of 'normal' connections (2008, 111). We do this for, as Deleuze (1989, 18) notes, we are not otherwise capable of coping with 'the unbearable'. He suggests of the time-image (also called 'the purely optical and sound image') that

a purely optical and sound situation ... makes us grasp, it is supposed to make us grasp, something intolerable and unbearable. ... It is a matter of something too powerful, or too unjust, but sometimes also too beautiful, and which henceforth outstrips our sensory-motor capacities. (Deleuze 1989, 18)

Violence is therefore made tolerable through the delirium of the time-image. Deleuze (1989, 19) continues that:

The purely optical and sound situation gives rise to a seeing function, at once fantasy and report, criticism and compassion, whilst sensory-motor situations, no matter how violent, are directed to a pragmatic visual function which 'tolerates' or 'puts up with' practically anything, from the moment it becomes involved in a system of actions and reactions.

In Kaganof's film viewers ultimately merge opposing experiences of 'fantasy and report', 'criticism and compassion', and in the mode of delirium, as if we are ourselves schizophrenic, I suggest that we 'put up' with non-reality and violence in the form of a symbolic flute gun. Perhaps the pulsating, flashing visual image employed by the filmmaker further seduces the viewer into accepting the real-unreal; into being drawn into madness. This, then, is the power of the time-image as theoretical idea, but also as actual experience in the film.

An analytic of film strategy that bears on the actors in particular is noted by Deleuze (1989). He argues that in the cinematography of the schizophrenic new types of actors are required:

... not simply the non-professional actors that neo-realism had revived at the beginning, but what might be called professional non-actors or, better, 'actor-mediums', capable of seeing and showing rather than acting, and either remaining dumb or undertaking some never-ending conversation, rather than of replying or following a dialogue. (Deleuze 1989, 20)

One can therefore plausibly propose that in Kaganof's film I was one of these 'actor-mediums', capable of seeing, and capable of showing, rather than acting out a script. As the actor-medium flautist I did not remain dumb. Instead, I engaged in 'undertaking some never-ending' flute-playing. In this case it is plausible that I give a 'monochrome' and relentless rendition of Glasser's solo so that Deleuze's 'fantasy and report', 'criticism and compassion' merge to distort the sensory-motoric experience, *showing delirium*. I suggest that the filmmaker employs me as actor-medium perhaps to expose schizophrenia in the people, the landscape and the classical music of this locality which is South Africa.

The portrayal of schizophrenia is perhaps not intended by the filmmaker, and yet it is an awareness that I increasingly experience as I take in the visuals and sounds of myself becoming the gunner-flautist in the film. I am also drawn to recognise schizophrenia as I digest psychoanalytic views on cinematography, and as I sense the past and present harm of the South African context. I find the analysis of schizophrenia a palliative to becoming a gunner at Marikana. Through a recognition of schizophrenia as process, I find the need for erecting barricades (or Bremner's notions of architectural 'walls, frontiers and border lands') less pressing. Instead, the impulse to live with a schizophrenia becomes imperative.

Kaganof's film points to aspects of delirium, thereby inviting a reading of schizophrenia as a communal local malaise – a 'breakdown'. The film shows that characters of the South African landscape – the police, the miners, the politicians, the musicians, the musicologists,

the music, all embedded in the histories and events of the South African landscape – are part of this madness. The audience, as prime protagonists who watch, and perhaps even the filmmaker himself, are included in this madness. If this is the endpoint, we have reached the breakdown caused by BwO; we have reached a catatonic state; we have reached death (Pisters 2008, 105).

In order to rebel against death, I have to proceed by relying on the 'other side' of the fine line that Deleuze depicts as a possible effect of schizophrenia. If not breakdown, Deleuze suggests, then break-through. The latter is Deleuze's 'machinic pole' of delirium that allows for some movement: this pole points to rhizomatic possibilities of creativity, however minimal, as Pisters reminds us (2008, 104).

I previously proposed that the characters and events of Kaganof's film suggest breakdown, immobility. However, when I apply the analytic of break-through, we encounter life. Some movement, however limited. In break-through the characters, including the gunner-flautist, are (according to Pisters) 'no longer driven by psychologically motivated motor action, but are defined in relation to the affects they can trigger (even by completely artificial means)' (2008, 112).

Trigger.

If our actions are defined by the 'affects they can trigger', and since we carry traces of schizophrenia whereby our pasts continue to harm our presents, then we are compelled to seek moments of break-through. I suggest that our symbolic gun-bearing actions, *also when it comes to Western art music*, therefore need to be pre-meditated, for our actions 'trigger' affects and effects, with the potential of causing further violence.

How to Play My Flute that is a Gun

In order to move from breakdown to break-through I turn to curatorial practice. I suggest that critical curatorship poses options into break-through. Curatorship provides creative ways of working with the (classical) flute repertoire and the classical music concert convention in which I have been trained and that I am unable to negate.

In my view, Aryan Kaganof operates as a curator, as an exhibition maker, employing curatorship as an interface between art, artists, the public, the institution and a topic. Kaganof's curating emits power and critical meaning-making and I suggest that a performing musician can harness similar influence when taking on the role of interventionist curator.

In an admittedly idealised definition of contemporary curating formulated by Beryl Graham and Sarah Cook (2010, 10), curating in the context of music performance acts as a kind of interface between cultural production (such as compositions and performances) AND institution AND audience in the development of critical meaning in partnership and discussion with publics, with the concert event featuring as the crucial nexus of intersection.⁸ Concert music practice therefore not only 'shows' repertoire, but facilitates 'the development of critical meaning'.

Critical meaning-making here refers not to Platonic *epistêmê* which claims universal forms of truth, but to knowledge as formulated by Mats Rosengren to be *doxa*. *Doxa* does not suggest that knowledge is 'apparent or illusory' but, instead, implies that knowledge is 'variable, situated and interested' (Rosengren 2009, 110). Knowledge, as *doxa*, is

always embodied, in ourselves as biological beings; formulated and/or preserved in some language, institution or ritual; practiced and upheld by one or many individuals, always in one historical moment or other and within the admittedly diffuse framework of an ever changing but still specific social situation. (Rosengren 2011, 156)

Curatorship can seep into the various ways in which audiences make meaning in and around and through classical music. Some of these ways of locating meaning are explicated by Jeff Warren (2014) in his claim that ethical responsibility in music-making and musicology implies human relations. Warren criticises many of the processes of locating meaning-and-music. However, I propose to move *beyond* his arguments for meaning that lies not only 'in music' and not only 'in context', by arguing that curating is able to encourage exploration and critical meaning-making as *curated process* and not only in the static products of music, nor

of music in a context. This resonates with the suggestion by Henk Borgdorff that 'aesthetic product' transforms to 'artistic argument' (Borgdorff 2012, 238).

Relying on a suggestion by Aidan Erasmus (2015) I propose that Steven Feld's 'acoustemic stratigraphies' (Feld, 2010), which analyse knowledges that surface from the interaction of sound and space, emerge through curating. In my journey with Glasser's *Jabula*, knowledges emerged from sound, in space and in time when I gave a first 'hearing knowledge' at a conference concert. A second phase of 'hearing knowledges' occurred in the film curation by Kaganof through the broadened context of placing *Jabula* next to a cello and drums, thereby creatively reframing the solo instrumental voice. Of greater interventionist significance, however, was his placing of the Glasser solo *into* Marikana. Subsequently, I have been drawn into these layers of knowledge. The processes, and the layers of knowledge created by them, have created the realisation that the classical flute can become a gun, and that its Western repertoire and concert practice are symbolically embedded in systemic violence.

I suggest that the intervention of the film into my practice as an awareness deposits a subversive reinterpretation. Having been an object (in a film), I claim energy from my concert practice understood as a form of curatorship. I become an agent. Despite immediate appearances, this film rebelliously reinforces in me an acknowledgement of the power of curatorial intervention with respect to classical performances on the flute.

Classical performance implies an honouring of the rigours of concert preparation towards excellence (often requiring periods of seclusion), and the general aspects of *technê* that Currie calls the 'good manners' of music (Currie 2012, 167-168). However, curating offers a plenitude of openings and challenges towards exploration, intervention, destabilisation, non-finality and openness of inquiry. By curating music critically, by acknowledging audience contribution that may also be diverse, and simply by challenging ourselves to go beyond our musical proprieties, Deleuzian post-schizophrenic break-through may become possible. Curating into break-through diverts the inward gaze outwards. On the direction of gaze (or 'attuning' of ears), Daniel Grimley states that:

... attuning our ears more closely to the often dissonant, unharmonizing sounds of the acoustic environment around us is a risky process, one that renders us vulnerable and that points unerringly to our own contingency, our transient and fleeting presence in the world. Yet resisting this process, turning our 'auditory gaze' inwards away from landscape in search of a deceptive autonomy of enquiry, perception, or the musical work, is a far greater irresponsibility. (Grimley 2011, 398)

In saying this, Grimley anticipates a foreboding depicted by the film in the sense that an 'inward' attunement to Western art music performance and analysis is devastatingly reckless. Such inwardly attuned music 'as a cultural gun' needs to be buried at Marikana 'with a threnody'.⁹ The film, I suggest, compels musicologists and performers who are unable to bury or *negate* classical music, instead to *curate* classical music's schizophrenia towards break-through.

Critical curation towards break-through enables a home-coming into the pluriversality of decolonial aestheSis, whereby classical music becomes a rebellious subaltern voice in a postcolonial locality. I propose that classical music, as break-through, is part of the organic process of decoloniality, and is able to curate meaningfully into local histories. However, decoloniality is not only equated with rebellion, but also acts as a desperately needed way of holding past, present and future together.¹⁰

ENDNOTES

1 Aidan Erasmus (with Heidi Grunebaum) presented response papers to *Threnody for the Victims of Marikana* on occasion of the Western Cape première of this 27 minute film. The screening and papers were hosted as part of the South African Contemporary History and Humanities seminar series, University of the Western Cape, South Africa, on 17 February 2015. In this article I quote from their response papers, of which the article versions are published in this journal.

2 Details about the conferences and the network can be found at <https://hearinglandscapecritically.net/>

3 Although there are two films, I refer to these in the singular throughout this article as the film material under discussion appears in both films. Links to the films are provided in the bibliography to this article.

4 The concert was presented by myself and three other musicians: Fiona Tozer (guitar), Hans Huysen (cello), and Benjamin van Eeden (piano). The concert took place in the Fisser Hall, Music Department, Stellenbosch University on 9 September 2013.

5 Kaganof places sections of text by Pisters on his blog without including reference to her primary source, namely Deleuze. In this article I shall engage firstly with Pisters, whereafter I shall turn to Deleuze's writing on the time-image in order to make further sense of the filmmaker's approach and process.

6 Erasmus probably makes this comment in reference to a film edit in which the conductor and composer Hans Huysen conducts his composition in silence (while in the background an exit sign has been camera-edited to read 'silence'). In the film Huysen cues for an entry that is also the cue to initiate gun fire.

7 In contrast to Totaro, Pisters notes a third 'dimension' of the image in addition to the movement-image and the time-image, namely the neuro-image. She observes that the neuro-image best 'opens up to spirituality' (Pisters 2012, 129; 153).

8 I adapt the definition for contemporary curating by Graham and Cook in a series of applications to classical music concert practice in my PhD dissertation (Pauw 2015, 22-24).

9 In a more recent series of e-mail exchanges with Kaganof in which I again discussed the gunner-flautist image with him, he posed the questions: 'Given its dirty history as a cultural gun, does Western classical music deserve to breakthrough? Is Marikana not a good place to bury it? With a threnody?' (Kaganof, May 2015). I concede that Kaganof was here referring to Western art music in general, as he does not make the distinction between inward-attuned and outward-attuned music. Furthermore, I see these recent comments as general observations that alluded to our discussion, rather than as a pertinent analysis of the film itself.

10 In an introductory talk on decoloniality delivered by Nick Shepherd (in response to a decolonial concert event that I presented in 2014), Shepherd points out that decoloniality is able to hold past, present and future as a continuum (cited in Pauw 2015, 226-229).

REFERENCES

Bremner, Lindsay. 2010. *Writing the City into Being: Essays on Johannesburg, 1998-2008*. Johannesburg: Fourthwall Books.

- Borgdorff, Henk. 2007. 'The Debate on Research in the Arts'. *Dutch Journal of Music Theory* 12(1), 1-17.
- . 2012. *The Conflict 'of the' Faculties: Perspectives on Artistic Research and Academia*. Leiden: Leiden University Press.
- Currie, James R. 2012. *Music and the Politics of Negation*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Darby, Helen. 2013. 'Review of Ian Buchanan and Patricia MacCormack's *Deleuze and the Schizoanalysis of Cinema*'. *Deleuze Studies* 7(2), 290-297.
- Deleuze, Gilles. 1989[1985]. *Cinema 2: The Time-Image*, tr. Hugh Tomlinson and Robert Galeta. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Erasmus, Aidan. 2015. Untitled Paper Response to the Film *Threnody for the Victims of Marikana* (Kaganof, 2014) presented at South African Contemporary History and Humanities Seminar Series, University of the Western Cape, South Africa, 17 February 2015.
- Erlmann, Veit. 2010. *Reason and Resonance: A History of Modern Aurality*. New York: Zone Books.
- Feld, Steven. 2010. 'Acoustemic Stratigraphies'. *Sensate*. Accessed 16 May 2015. <http://sensatejournal.com/2011/03/steven-feld-acoustemic-stratigraphies/>.
- Graham, Beryl and Sarah Cook. 2010. *Rethinking Curating: Art after New Media*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: MIT Press.
- Grimley, Daniel M. 2011. 'Music, Landscape, Attunement: Listening to Sibelius's *Tapiola*'. *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 64(2), 394-398.
- Grunebaum, Heidi. 2015. Untitled Paper Response to the Film *Threnody for the Victims of Marikana* (Kaganof, 2014) presented at South African Contemporary History and Humanities Seminar Series, University of the Western Cape, South Africa, 17 February 2015.
- Higdon, Jennifer. Programme notes to *rapid-fire*. Accessed 11 June 2016. <http://www.jenniferhigdon.com/pdf/program-notes/rapid-fire.pdf>.
- Janssen, Helgé. 2014. 'A Threnody to the Marikana Victims'. *Artslink* 23 April 2014. Accessed 15 August 2014. http://www.artlink.co.za/news_article.htm?contentID=35297.
- Kaganof, Aryan. *kagablog*. <http://kaganof.com/kagablog/>.
- Mignolo, Walter D. 2012. *Local Histories/Global Designs*. 2nd edition. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Mignolo, Walter and Rolando Vázquez. 2013. Decolonial AestheSis: Colonial Wounds/ Decolonial Healings. *Social Text Journal/ Periscope*. Accessed

- on 15 February 2015. http://socialtextjournal.org/periscope_topic/decolonial_aesthesis/.
- Monelle, Raymond. 2006. *The Musical Topic: Hunt, Military and Pastoral*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.
- Muller, Stephanus. 2013. 'Spectres of Excess'. Paper delivered at Hearing Landscape Critically conference, Stellenbosch, South Africa, 9-11 September 2013.
- Pauw, E.M. (Marietjie). 2015. *Curating South African Flute Compositions: Landscape as Theme of Exhibition*. PhD Dissertation. Stellenbosch: University of Stellenbosch, 2015.
- Pisters, Patricia. 2008. 'Delirium, Cinema or Machines of the Invisible?'. In *Deleuze and the Schizoanalysis of Cinema*, eds. Ian Buchanan and Patricia MacCormack. London: Continuum.
- . 2009. 'Machines of the Invisible: Manifesto for a Schizoanalysis of Media Culture'. *Kagablog*. Accessed on 4 February 2015. <http://kaganof.com/kagablog/2009/02/08/machines-of-the-invisible-manifesto-for-a-schizoanalysis-of-media-culture-by-patricia-pisters/>.
- . 2012. *The Neuro-Image: A Deleuzian Film-Philosophy of Digital Screen Culture*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Rosengren, Mats. 2009. 'Art+Research ≠ Artistic research'. In *Art and Artistic Research*, eds. Corina Caduff, Fiona Siegenthaler and Tan Wälchli. *Zürich Yearbook of the Arts* 6, 106-121.
- . 2011. 'On Doxa – the Epistemology of the New Rhetoric'. In *Scandinavian Studies in Rhetoric/ Rhetorica Scandinavica 1997-2010*, eds. Jans Elmelund Kjeldsen and Jan Grue. Ödåkra: Retorikförlaget publishing, 156-167.
- Shepherd, Nick. 2014. 'Response to *Bones, Bricks, Mortar and Souls*'. Talk on decoloniality transcribed and included as Addendum 8 in PhD dissertation by E.M. Pauw. See: Pauw, E.M. (Marietjie). 2015. *Curating South African Flute Compositions: Landscape as Theme of Exhibition*. PhD Dissertation. Stellenbosch: University of Stellenbosch, 2015, 226-229.
- Totaro, Donato. 1999. 'Gilles Deleuze's Bergsonian Film Project: Part 2: Cinema 2: The Time-Image'. *Offscreen* 3(3). Accessed on 11 June 2016. <http://offscreen.com/view/bergson2>.
- Warren, Jeff R. 2014. *Music and Ethical Responsibility*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

FILM AND DISCOGRAPHY

- Hendrix, Jimi. *Machine Gun* (composition, arranged for bass flute and string quartet. Bass flute, Robert Dick with the Soldier String Quartet). Accessed 11 June 2016. <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Knqyh7IG6Zk>.
- Higdon, Jennifer. *rapid∅fire* (composition for solo flute). Accessed 11 June 2016. <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CBsodbUOypo> (flute, Jiyoun Hur, 2012), and <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GzrYVwyxAFU> (flute, Laura Ploves, 2014).
- Kaganof, Aryan. 2014. *Night is Coming: A Threnody for the Victims of Marikana* (film). Accessed 3 June 2016. <http://vimeo.com/120610859>.
- . 2014. *Threnody for the Victims of Marikana* (film). Accessed 3 June 2016. <http://vimeo.com/110378819>.

AUTHOR'S BIOGRAPHY

Marietjie Pauw is a research fellow at Africa Open – Institute for Music, Research and Innovation (Stellenbosch University). In 2015 she was awarded a PhD by Stellenbosch University for artistic research conducted in the Music Department. The title of her dissertation was *Curating South African Flute Compositions: Landscape as Theme of Exhibition*.

Marietjie Pauw, Africa Open – Institute for Music, Research and Innovation, Stellenbosch University, Private Bag X1, Matieland, 7602.
E-mail: empauw@gmail.com